IN THE MATTER OF THE CLAIM	*	BEFORE MICHELLE W. COLE,
OF THOMAS HUCKER,	*	AN ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE
CLAIMANT	*	OF THE MARYLAND OFFICE
AGAINST THE MARYLAND HOME	*	OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS
IMPROVEMENT GUARANTY FUND	*	
FOR THE ALLEGED ACTS OR	*	
OMISSIONS OF JOSE ARGUETA	*·	
REYES T/A REYE'S	*	
CONSTRUCTION GROUP, LLC,	*	OAH No.: LABOR-HIC-02-20-00089
RESPONDENT	*	MHIC No.: 19 (05) 1214

# PROPOSED DECISION

STATEMENT OF THE CASE
ISSUES
SUMMARY OF THE EVIDENCE
PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT
DISCUSSION
PROPOSED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW
RECOMMENDED ORDER

# STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On June 21, 2019, Thomas Hucker (Claimant) filed a claim (Claim) with the Maryland Home Improvement Commission (MHIC) Guaranty Fund (Fund), under the jurisdiction of the Department of Labor (Department), for reimbursement of \$11,390.13<sup>2</sup> in actual losses allegedly suffered as a result of an incomplete home improvement by Jose Argueta Reyes, trading as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> On July 1, 2019, the Maryland Department of Labor, Licensing, and Regulation became the Department of Labor.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> During the hearing, the Claimant amended this amount to \$8,970.13.

June ortuga Britan ja traja. **東部人の実際資料のある。これではできるが**。 Frair do 1 Sager Stage and Tarrell Stage Contact of CREET THE LAMEAUSE SCHOOL FOR SHE TENTE SECULIAR SECTION OF THE PARTY OF THE P JOHNSON OF THE PARTY. THE PRESIDENCE COUNTY OF · 我是我们就是我们看着,我们也不是自己的情况。 From Congress Late Brown 그 아무리 바꾸 마다 그래요 이 토었다. 32AO 1 n la ragiation de la respectação de la 是是"中国产生"的"国"基础规则的基础。 the Copies of April 19 and 19 and the Company of the product of the part of the Copies and the C able of the following of the first of the constant of the following of the constant of the first of the constant Opportment Littleborg Signification of the cold paragraph of the arbitrage Symposius St. Littleborg Of ිය. අදල්ව දැන් වෙන් අතු කුරුව මැනි ලබ පෙනෙනුවන් දෙපෙන් ක්රීමයන් ඔබ එම කිල්වෙන් නම් පිරිදිය and a second and the control of the property of the second . At Conseller for the Conseller of the Not the Arthres is stabled states the since to specifically highly the

Reye's Construction Group, LLC (Respondent).<sup>3</sup> Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. §§ 8-401 through 8-411 (2015).<sup>4</sup> On December 20, 2019, the MHIC forwarded the matter to the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH) for a hearing.

I held a remote hearing on November 25, 2020 at the Office of Administrative Hearings (OAH). Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-407(a), (c); Code of Maryland Regulations (COMAR) 09.08.03.03A. Andrew Brouwer, Assistant Attorney General, Department, represented the Fund. The Claimant represented himself. The Respondent represented himself.

The contested case provisions of the Administrative Procedure Act, the Department's hearing regulations, and the Rules of Procedure of the OAH govern procedure in this case. Md. Code Ann., State Gov't §§ 10-201 through 10-226 (2014 & Supp. 2020); COMAR 09.01.03; COMAR 28.02.01.

### **ISSUES**

- 1. Did the Claimant sustain an actual loss compensable by the Fund as a result of the Respondent's acts or omissions?
  - 2. If so, what is the amount of the compensable loss?

### SUMMARY OF THE EVIDENCE

#### **Exhibits**

Unless otherwise noted, I admitted the following exhibits on the Claimant's behalf:

Cl. Ex. 1 Chart of Repairs, undated

Cl. Ex. 2 Contract, January 19, 2016

Cl. Ex. 3 Copy of check, May 31, 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Respondent's business name has changed during the pendency of this case.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Unless otherwise noted, all references hereinafter to the Business Regulation Article are to the 2015 Replacement Volume of the Maryland Annotated Code.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Admitted except for the references to Yelp.

	ulla est estaj, estas ja
· Long Burk was Commenced and the Commenced and	27⊊ x8€ malatio∳ l'afgeta a geod
establishing apply his a special second the second second	en grådelige tegniser folktig
Complete the complete and the property of the complete th	acago, and distribute that,
	amentinaja Angele
granist kirthermagna ee fargasi tii seeta	ที่สาราช 6 สาราชมสุขาศาสตร์ (มีสารรัช
. Particular e la secunita de la companya de la constante de la companya de la constante de la companya de la constante de la	kreikky mory todofyma a fill
	ed je vove godinego primje.
Land the company of t	OSSE (CO PALIF MAS CONTRACTOR
	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
ordina alteres describera logijos i altere lago, a con Augusta et e	laway kanaka ka
	าก ทั้งรู้คอย <del>15 ค่อง ภาพมูม</del> าสุรษฐ์
	t e Digital et a los E
	ARM C
ne ut i tarbenni e Tradit de a élement e l'arcent lat receile : «	े क्रिकारचा क्यार काचेस् कुट्टी १००
	of for 2
	And the way to the first the

Augustic (1971) de la company de la company

Cl. Ex. 4	Copy of check, August 5, 2016
Cl. Ex. 5	Copy of check, February 7, 2017
Cl. Ex. 6	Invoice, Michael Hancock Construction, March 1, 2018
Cl. Ex. 7	Proposal, Floor Max, December 11, 2017
Cl. Ex. 8	Receipt, Michael Hancock Construction, December 31, 2017
Cl. Ex. 9	Home Comfort Retail Installment Agreement, February 2018
Cl. Ex. 10	BGE Home Statement, February 27, 2019
Cl. Ex. 11	Final Invoice, First Impression Hardscapes, June 19, 2018; Copy of check, April 12, 2018; Copy of check, September 19, 2018
Cl. Ex. 12	Invoice, Electracon, Inc., March 16, 2018; Copy of Check, April 11, 2018
Cl. Ex. 13	Invoice, Michael Hancock Construction, November 14, 2018; Copy of check, November 14, 2018
Cl. Ex. 14	Photographs
Cl. Ex. 15	Not Admitted
Cl. Ex. 16	Department Registration Inquiry Screens, April 3, 2019
Cl. Ex. 17	Not Offered
The R	despondent did not offer any exhibits for admission into evidence at the hearing.
I adm	itted the following exhibits on the Fund's behalf:
GF Ex. 1	Hearing Order, December 10, 2019
GF Ex. 2	Notice of Remote Hearing, September 2, 2020
GF Ex. 3	Notice of Remote Hearing, March 3, 2020
GF Ex. 4	Notice of Hearing, January 28, 2020
GF Ex. 5	Letter from the MHIC to the Respondent, July 9, 2019; Home Improvement Claim Form, June 21, 2019
GF Ex. 6	Department Registration Inquiry Screens, September 18, 2020

	•			
			*	
		-		
		हरकुर राज्य सम्बद्धाः स्टब्स्ट्रेस्टर	i Lejuva etinteja ugalasater	क्षाना केव्या संस्कृत करा अस्तर है।
v	Ç.	gapangera gripe. Prajeri gasa ang je	o statical contribution of the	ely in the sette and the appearance
		grande de grande de la composição de la co	;  ####################################	
		अपने कर कर्तिक क्षेत्र ।		
131. 3.4.		g spirit og fra og e		
	/ V 2			
		कार्त्सक्ष अने अपिक	e grandam po godina. Postanam po godina	
	4116	वेदि हार्यक्तुं, कार र	en de la	कुर्यानक कुर्या करिकुकारक इ.स्.व्हे केटक (वर्षी)
, jak		gudeshevser gotesar	tion of magnity is a series.	
	10			
V. 1 3.3	•	April 1		
		with the sound of the		
	13	· 전공화성과 성포 후택(인근) -	a dhe garan agase. Taran	
J. 3.	e <u>;</u> ,	andres geraties		
			Programme Company	
C. E.	; f	The section of the second	वे अस्तर के <b>तम महरू है।</b>	
	<b>:</b> 1	इ.स.च्या १५५ में १५६ म		
	ig g	्रे, <sup>भि</sup> र्देशसाम्बर्धे	nie skied Albert	
	1.	The ten The see 5		AND A PROBLEM OF THE PROPERTY
		Tapadal, Gast Ass		
€*****	y <sup>i</sup>	Responsible to the second	d nor ge regid <b>ec</b> ió	
GE CY				

OF THE STATE OF THE STATE OF

CHERNIA.

# GF Ex. 7 Notice of Remote Hearing, September 21, 2020

### **Testimony**

The Claimant testified and presented the testimony of his wife, Amy Fortin.

The Respondent testified on his own behalf.

The Fund did not present any witness testimony at the hearing.

# PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT

I find the following facts by a preponderance of the evidence:

- 1. At all times relevant to the subject of this hearing, the Respondent was a licensed home improvement contractor under the MHIC.
- 2. On January 19, 2016, the Claimant and the Respondent entered into a Contract to convert the existing garage into family room living space and to construct a storage shed.
- 3. The Respondent agreed to perform the following work under the Contract for the garage renovation:
  - Remove garage door
  - Create a brick wall 35 inches from the existing floor of concrete, install an energyefficient window with security lock (specify size) (owner provided) and close the rest of the space with brick
  - Create a space for two, energy-efficient windows 36" each with security lock (owner provided) on west wall of the space (brick wall) at the entry
  - Contractor to provide drawings for proposed window installations
  - Install windows with frame (PVC/wood material) and caulk windows
  - Create a new insulate (specify insulate) floor 8 inch from the concrete
  - Bring floor to level with existing home (Please provide a drawing)
  - Make the existing door into a window (owner provided) on the east side of the space
  - Do the frame for the floor with 2 X 6 and install new plywood
  - Frame out the walls
  - Do the electrical work including installation of outlets (32" off ground)
  - Install insulation with an R-49 rating from the attic
  - Install insulation (R-49) between rafters and finish the ceiling <u>keeping the cathedral</u> shape
  - Install two wood desks on the east side of the room in the alcove (to customer specification) architect specification
  - Prime and paint the desks

granding()

arior il un martin rigilio produtto di interiore interiore distante di finazio, finazione primi sul sul sulti

· Males of the following the first contraduction.

Definish mentapa deminasa an afa magada maga a madi pedali pat

olumbia, postalla soluncia, agres o altatalon escolata (escolata).

alternative and a fill offermation as a provider on the letter &

์ เป็นไป และ Gell แบบไทยสมาชาว และคล สมุทภาย สมาชาวปลา ค่องส

et etrapa Pulle d'itre présent a grand d<mark>e</mark>taction palet suite d'ATE (le republié de l'ATE)

o apadrousio o jih ka mai moja aro afarat galosi olapijo placijo oporal galijiho sim minama

and the frequency of the second decelority, dealth or and to be the configuration and the configuration of the con

jakish resar ayang

and some transfer.

on personal de figigo (mérodo de los establicados de la composição de figura poterial especial). Por establicação foto de la exercicação de composição de la figuração de la composição de la composição de la c

The malarge set of the experience of the first of the first of the first of the exercise for the comment of the exercise for the comment of the exercise for th

าง - **สุดแ**น้ว **ปัก**ระสา พลิทิสที่สำนักเลยของสาด 1 กับ ... คาที่สามา 1 คำกับการสำนัก เลยารัก

supplied of the last (a post of ) and AWTS in a 18 post supplied to the last

को प्रकारत के क्षेत्री के माहित्याच्या किया, को ता प्राप्तिक माहित्यों है, इस माहित्यों के कार है कार है के स् माहित्यों के के सिंहें अने हैं अनुसार है जो अपने हुए को लिले सिंह माहित्यों के के कार्यों के स्वार्थी करते हैं

from the William of the site o

g in the Consensus Angle of An

on an multiple case in contract if the annies of the state of the contract in the contract in

to A minute had by the

- Install temper glass overlay on the desks
- Install lighting (owner provided) above the desks architect recommendation
- Build 4-5 wood cubbies to customer specification along the interior wall facing the garage door (install electrical outlets per cubbies with the hardware)
- Prime and paint the cubbies (or consider pre-primed)
- Install a T brace to support the ceiling fan
- Install ceiling fan (OP)
- Test ceiling fan for any flux movement after installation on both forward and reverse/winter summer settings
- Install recessed lights (4" Insulated Contact cans, LED and dimmer) into the drywall of finished ceiling Contractor to provide a drawing for lights
- Install speakers in the ceiling (explore options)
- Install baseboard
- Enlarge the entry doorway (12" plus)
- Install AC and heat ducts in center of the room
- Install Mitsubishi overall conditioning unit for the space
- Update the subfloor for hardwood
- Install hardwood match as existing
- Prime and paint (2 coats) of OP paint throughout the space
- Cleaning will be done on a daily basis to ensure safety of children in home

# (Cl. Ex. 2 (emphasis in original)).

- 4. The Respondent agreed to perform the following work under the Contract for construction of the storage shed:
  - [Claimant] will get permit for the shed
  - Build the platforms [and] the decking to seat the new shed
  - Build the frame walls
  - Install new roof
  - Install waterproof paper
  - Install two doors 36 inches
  - Install new siding (customer will select the color)
  - Bring power to shed
  - Install lighting per owner specification standard light
  - Cleaning should be done on a daily basis to ensure safety of the children in home

#### (Cl. Ex. 2).

- 5. The original agreed-upon Contract price was \$27,500.00, to be paid in three installments.
  - 6. On May 31, 2016, the Claimant paid the Respondent \$9,166.00.

	그 보험하게 되었다고요? 그 사용사람 하면 하면 하셨다. 그 그 그는
<ul> <li>กล้ายกระทั่งโดยกระทำเหลือดอยู่เข้ากร้องสามารถได้ และไ</li> </ul>	and a recognized by the state of the con-
Company to the contract of the company of the contract of	
( p. c. รี่ทั่งรู้เคาระดั ความ ระบากขึ้นการกรุ ค. คำรวก	
	Supplied the state of the state
New york that he wield will also seems as	
	The estre of substitute the con-
्रम् । तुर्वे अस्तर्भात् के अकाराके एक भौकित कार्याक महास्था के तुर्वे के हैं।	l and the second of the second
er gift sein Tromain gibbs auch g	
- I	The strong at the continue of
	real control of the last of the
new.	gen tide, o wieke this was been been
	La divisió Pari I de Si
	1
	run il Esp Sissa esp espladi i
	र के भर की एक को किन्दी । एक की एक
A Service of the serv	1 a
हराना, अने का समित्र के पूर्व के प्रवासी के	
	a ipaigge of the degree of soft and .
ានស្រាស់ និង	Inertailly on a Ville Color De
	reads again again to though not
	d figure of the place for the fifty of
entire the second se	- <b>1</b>
	The state of the s
	state we grade this self-to
	John M. Brok v. Witen. K.
e de la companya del companya de la companya del companya de la co	Provide a grafia o tala in casi in si
	The state of the s
And the second s	Annamy as the delivery as
e per project plant for the all being graphs of the result and spring	The second and and arrivant to the
and the stranger of the country of \$20 or a stranger page and or a great	ाक्षात्र हेन्द्र क्षेत्र क्षेत
	2 (m. ) A1.i
to station respects. A solid provided to	

- 7. Work under the Contract started on June 28, 2016 and was supposed to be completed within five weeks.
  - 8. On August 5, 2016, the Claimant paid the Respondent \$9,166.00.
- 9. In response to the Respondent's request for advance payment of the final installment, on February 7, 2017, the Claimant paid the Respondent \$4,583.00 (half the remaining installment amount).
- 10. Sometime after receiving the partial third payment, the Respondent stopped working on the Claimant's renovation.
- 11. The Claimant and his wife made several attempts to contact the Respondent in order to arrange for completion of the renovation without success. The Respondent did not respond to texts or telephone calls.
- 12. When the Respondent stopped working, the renovated room was unfinished. The heating and air conditioning ducts were installed, but the Mitsubishi conditioning unit was not. The outlets were exposed. The floor was not sanded or finished.
  - 13. On an unknown date, the shed collapsed.
- 14. The Claimant hired contractors to finish the renovation and to perform additional work within the home.
- 15. On December 11, 2017, FloorMax submitted a proposal for completing sanding and finishing of the floor in the renovated space, the kitchen, dining room, living room, and foyer. The estimate for the "new addition" was \$1,080.00. (Cl. Ex. 7).
- 16. On April 11, 2018, the Claimant paid \$2,057.00 to Electracon, Inc. for electrical work to finish the renovated space.

रक्ष रहे रेप्टन एक्ट्रन स्कून केटर अहेरी हुंस	haidh chù mhail sine i		
		A CONTRACTOR	ं <sub>सि</sub> ंकुल <b>ः</b>
in the second of	il liga salyahdi gé		
turit adriculter order and principal	Bragos and Law, Li	. Of the care	•
and Visida (10 and 1) And make a man i	eng ngagariga.	ing Tour efter.	n e d'aglas,
		√ on comentions	nd germas
an grantific ways of a troopset.		a subsection	
		eros sima din koda	er dag dag
ည်းမောင်သူ့အောင်ကရုံမြောက်သူမှာ စည်းမေးမှုမှ က	i Amerika serengi (1919) kul Maria dan mengangan berakan	lange in the state of	• <u>1</u>
s es bir qui princii de de reve grante		sala combilista	ves as rejectors
		tin Shelys a myses	
त्यों जिल्ला है। अन्य के अंद्राक्षण औ	gabienwie egogoloo		
in merelin i ti de granduse des responsables	u is to a libertuicus en eve	essa nationaliment (p. s	era ješt sij
		ित्री. डिस्म्स्ट्रेस्टकेट र	sių įstigaliji
		e en arte de di	
ากกลับได้เพิ่มในเป็นในการกระทุกกระทั่งเกลา	. (8) de a mologida Q.		•
		o.ec.il	
The State of Performance and the contraction	The restaurant of the		
o jedi, jargadi kaprabili, sa			
the second of th		्रेड <sup>त</sup> ्र शिक्ष्मी इंद्रावर्षिक र	AL ANT
े कि बेक्केट्टो एक्स अस्टी एक्स बाद्य <del>स्</del> र्वीहरू है। १००० है			
		र्शे (अवस्थितक सम्बंधि	n www.

- 17. On November 14, 2018, the Claimant paid \$500.00 to Michael Hancock Construction, LLC, to install supports and finish the shed construction.
- 18. The Claimant paid \$4,588.00 to BGE Home Products to install a ductless HVAC unit.
- 19. The Claimant paid \$4,025.00 to First Impression Hardscapes to install pervious pavers and perform landscaping.
- 20. The Claimant paid \$1,030.13 to Michael Hancock Construction to perform carpentry and repair brickwork.

### **DISCUSSION**

In this case, the Claimant has the burden of proving the validity of the Claim by a preponderance of the evidence. Bus. Reg. § 8-407(e)(1); Md. Code Ann., State Gov't § 10-217 (2014); COMAR 09.08.03.03A(3). To prove a claim by a preponderance of the evidence means to show that it is "more likely so than not so" when all the evidence is considered. *Coleman v. Anne Arundel Ctv. Police Dep't*, 369 Md. 108, 125 n.16 (2002).

An owner may recover compensation from the Fund "for an actual loss that results from an act or omission by a licensed contractor . . . ." Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-405(a); see also COMAR 09.08.03.03B(2) ("The Fund may only compensate claimants for actual losses . . . incurred as a result of misconduct by a licensed contractor."). "[A]ctual loss' means the costs of restoration, repair, replacement, or completion that arise from an unworkmanlike, inadequate, or incomplete home improvement." Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-401. For the following reasons, I find that the Claimant has proven eligibility for compensation.

The Claimant contends that he has suffered an actual loss as the result of an incomplete and inadequate home improvement by the Respondent. He noted various deficiencies in the

La constitue da la Carte de Maria de la Carte de la Carte de Carte

and white the second of the first of the first of the first of the second of the second of the second of the first of the first of the second of the first of the second of the first of the second of the second of the first of the second of

# 

The state of the second st

The surpression of the state of the surpression of

 Respondent's work and reviewed photographs and estimates for work performed by other contractors to complete the project. He included a summary, listing the costs to repair and complete the following work: patching holes and refacing walls, sanding and finishing floor, finishing carpentry and repairing brickwork, installing ductless HVAC unit, installing pervious pavers and landscaping, completing electrical work, and fixing floor of shed, installing support posts.

The Claimant's wife also testified at the hearing and concurred with the Claimant's testimony. She added that she and the Respondent talked about some changes to the Contract, but that changes were never included in the Contract. Further, she reported making at least twenty attempts to contact the Respondent by text and telephone after he stopped working at the property with no response.

The Respondent largely did not dispute the evidence presented by the Claimants. He agreed that there was work remaining on the project when he stopped working, including finishing the interior walls of the renovated space, installing the fan and conditioning unit, and finishing the floors. He reported that some of the delays in completing the renovation resulted from problems with the electrician. He also reported personal financial problems because of an unexpected surgery, a new baby, and his divorce. He stated that he needed the final payment to complete the renovation, but was unable to do so because the Claimant did not release the final funds and he was awaiting additional payment before continuing with the work. The Respondent agreed that he talked to the Claimant's wife about making the area outside of the renovated room look nice by creating flower beds, but never included this in the Contract. He stated that this work was not included in the agreed-upon cost and that he could not perform the additional work

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The duct work for the HVAC system was completed when the Respondent stopped working.

The first production of the first section and the contract of the contract of

The court of the c

The property of the first of the second seco

or the real of make my real weeks when we have been a configuration will be a few or all real

without further payment. Finally, the Respondent questioned the estimates provided by other contractors and argued that these estimates were excessive based on his assessment of the work remaining when he stopped working. He claimed that 98% of the work under the Contract was completed when he stopped working.

Is the Claimant barred from recovering from the Fund?

Certain claimants are excluded from recovering from the Fund altogether. In this regard, a claimant must prove that: (1) the claimant resides in the home as to which the claim is made, or owns no more than three dwelling places; (2) the claimant is not an employee, officer or partner of the contractor; or the spouse or other immediate relative of the contractor or the contractor's employees, officers or partners; (3) the work at issue did not involve new home construction; (4) the claimant did not unreasonably reject the contractor's good faith effort to resolve the claim; (5) the claimant complied with any contractual arbitration clause before seeking compensation from the Fund; (6) there is no pending claim for the same loss in any court of competent jurisdiction and the claimant did not recover for the actual loss from any source; and (7) the claimant filed the claim with the MHIC within three years of the date the claimant knew, or with reasonable diligence should have known, of the loss or damage. Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-405(c), (d), (f), (g), 8-408(b)(1); Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-101(g)(3)(i) (Supp. 2020).

The undisputed evidence in this case establishes there are no *prima facie* impediments barring the Claimant from recovering from the Fund. There is no argument to the contrary, and the evidence establishes that the Claimant resides in the home as to which the claim is made; that he has never been an employee, officer or partner of the Respondent and is not related to any of the Respondent's employees, officers or partners; that the home improvement was not new home construction; that the Claimant did not reject any good faith effort by the Respondent to resolve

and which was presented and in the energy too

Surger to be a special of the constitution to be subject to

and the first and the comment of the first the first and the first and the comment of the first and ารัฐนุโดยอย่างเฉพาะเพื่อที่ก็ที่เดียว คือการ คำได้ เป็นที่ เมื่อที่เมื่อที่เพลาไทยได้ เป็นเป็นเป็น เพลานี้เคียม ยนยา ที่เพิ่มที่มีผ

overlie ver Lei breunisch mit ein ist ihrer finderen die brie der brie 1900 (in die 1900). Beng dem mit his geweiten ารมหาราชที่ กระบาง ของ ใช้แมว ผู้กรับกับ คัดของมีรักการ จำกุการประวัติ **ปกับ** โดยรูก โดยภู การมหายท ran, russa nuli salt. Crea usives est de 24 kg i Lada i de 1602 at i sul sterre crempte del tarde, contrarento

างเลยข้องส่วา ที่ยางเปลี่ยดแล้ว ของเกิดเลี้ยดเล่า <mark>ค</mark>รามรู้ทั้งของหลุด กลากกลางให้เกิดเกาะ เกาะเคลี้ยา ที่ยดเมื่ to the principal of the experience of the contract of the first of the contract of the contrac

regroup to explicit a regulation of a horizon alique, their action of regulation access of the refres no alle and les para la la contrata de <mark>treix prefi</mark>ca e plane de la contrata del contrata de la contrata de la contrata del contrata de la contrata del contrata de la contrata del contrata de la contrata de la contrata del c i jūgusta vienimente varadati ja avaita vieni<mark>taka laivas</mark>vali ja jagavasta vai kara vieningas karakata karakata ารทำสามาสทางสามาสามารถ (เมริกา สมาร์ก การเการ์การการสมาชาวสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสามา tank it angang pang ketalah sangga kanggan nanggan kanggan kanggan kanggan pengan panggan panggan taka 🔀 างเมาการของ การเกาะ รุงการตระหว่า<mark>งในที่เหตุ</mark>กันที่เคย เพียงรู้ว่า <mark>เ</mark>กษุ กราบ ควาที่ (สิ่งกุณหลัก ครับ 10.5 An 1979 (Line ), on compagner on the explicit of the contract of the contract of the contract of the contract of ารอาเพียงน้ำ ความ และ ได้รับออก เปรี่ โดยส<mark>ามหน้า</mark> คาที่สามาร ได้ เปลี่ยงสิ่งสามารถ เป็น โดยได้ และผู้สำรัช and a series of the series of prida (il. 1. deligrafia) un una culta citi i cui largesti de la complitació de trabusca (il

From the last different infectional compacts being consequent to the last consequence of the consequence of the ia la contration granding op i salgoda. Dit i groektragen en 1960, en frietre filitable seili sti un not the forestrong like betried brigger with like right about the error for one state. Under the tip on we would the claim; that the Claimant has not taken any other legal action to recover monies for any actual loss in connection with the Respondent's work; and that there is no arbitration clause in the Contract.

Likewise, the evidence supports a conclusion that the Claimant timely filed his claim with the MHIC on June 27, 2019. Even though, under the terms of the Contract, the Respondent was supposed to finish the renovation within five weeks of the signing of the Contract in May 2016, the Claimant indicated on the Complaint form that work was performed between May 2016 and September 2017. Moreover, the Claimant testified that the Respondent stopped working at the Claimant's home sometime following the final payment on February 7, 2017, and he and his wife made several attempts to contact the Respondent after he stopped working in attempts to have him return to work. As such, the Claimant filed his complaint within three years of the date he had knowledge of the incomplete home improvement. I conclude that the Claimant is statutorily eligible to recover compensation from the Fund.

Did the Claimant establish an actual loss as the result of an unworkmanlike, inadequate or incomplete home improvement by the Respondent?

On the date of the hearing, the Claimant submitted his exhibits electronically, which he reviewed during his own testimony. Largely, he reported general work that was performed by other contractors to complete the home improvement. He presented estimates and invoices to show the costs for this work. As to each estimate or invoice, he testified that he hired by the particular contractor to complete the Respondent's incomplete or inadequate renovation in that area. He also presented a summary, identifying costs to repair and complete the following work: patching holes and refacing walls, sanding and finishing floor, finishing carpentry and repairing brickwork, installing ductless HVAC unit, installing pervious pavers and landscaping, complete electrical work, and fixing floor of shed, installing support posts. He did not present any expert

the state of the s

The territories to state year of the part is established by one of the case of the party of the

en a temperatura de la como como en procesa de la como dela como de la como d

6,000

ीत समाप्ति पात्र परता केमेर रेप्यू असीर्व अस्ति अस्ति अस्ति असे असे देवस्थितस्य स्थिति अस्ति स्थानु स्थानुस्री

testimony regarding the amount of work remaining under the Contract when the Respondent stopped working or what specific work was required to complete the renovation according to the Contract. The Claimant also presented photographs, which he stated demonstrated the Respondent's incomplete and inadequate work. However, much of the photographic evidence was not coupled with testimony as to what was wrong according to the Contract, whether the work comported with professional or industry standards, or what work was required to remedy the alleged deficiencies.

The Respondent did not dispute that he failed to complete the renovation. Rather, he challenges the Claimant's evidence regarding the amount of work that still needed to be done to complete the renovation and the estimated costs to complete the renovation. He described the work he completed under the Contract, reporting that 98 percent of the project was completed when he stopped working. He stated that the estimates provided to complete the renovation were excessive considering the amount of work remaining. Finally, he argued that he should not be held responsible for the Claimant's claim because Reye's Construction was no longer an "active" business.

As a preliminary matter, I reject the Respondent's claim that he cannot be held liable for deficient or incomplete work because the name of his construction company has changed. There is no dispute that the Respondent performed work under a Contract that he entered with the Claimant. At the time of the Contract, the Respondent was a licensed home improvement contractor under the MHIC.

Based on the evidence, I conclude that the Claimant has established an actual loss based on an incomplete renovation. However, I agree with the Respondent that the summary of costs provided by the Claimant fails to accurately represent the actual loss sustained by the Claimant

and the form of the second control of the form of the second control of the second contr

和文字的 1995 (A. C.)

The control of the co

The first of the second of the

and the state of the following property of the state of t

as a result of acts or omissions by the Respondent. As set forth above, the Claimant presented evidence showing that he entered into a Contract with the Respondent to complete a renovation of the Claimant's garage into living space, which was not completed when the Respondent stopped working on the renovation. Further, the Contract called for construction of a storage shed, which collapsed shortly after it was constructed and required additional supports to complete the shed construction. When the Respondent failed to complete the renovation, the Claimant hired other contractors to complete the unfinished work.

While it is clear that some portion of work on the renovated area was incomplete when the Respondent stopped working, I conclude that the Claimant has failed to establish that all of the work performed by other contractors, as set out in his summary, was necessary to repair deficiencies in the Respondent's work or to complete the renovation. For instance, the evidence does not support the Claimant's claim that he suffered an actual loss as a result of the Respondent's carpentry and brickwork, installation of the ductless HVAC unit, or installation of payers and landscaping, which I find is additional work outside of the Contract. The testimony failed to establish that the Respondent's carpentry or brickwork was incompetent or that there was additional construction required in this area under the Contract when the Respondent stopped working. Further, while the Contract included installation of "AC and heat ducts in the center room" and installation of "Mitsubishi overall conditioning unit for the space," there was no testimony to explain how the installation of a "ductless" HVAC unit constituted completion of work under the Contract. Likewise, even though the parties agreed that they had discussed additional work by the Respondent on the exterior area, they did not agree on what was included in that work, and no agreement was ever recorded in the Contract. The Claimant's evidence does not establish an actual loss with regard to these items. The fact that the Claimant paid another

द रहासुक्षु के क्षेत्रका हा स्वतंत्रक है होता है है जुकका का उन्हों । उन्हें का के हिन्दे किया के कियु अवस्थित the contemporary and the contemporaries and the contemporary and the contemporary and the contemporary and the न्य विकास हो पर बहे । ते केन्य प्रत्या विकास के केन्द्र केन्य होता है के किन प्रत्या के ते प्रत्या के किन के क न्तु नक्षात्री नक्षात्र अस्ति अस्ति अस्ति कृष्टि कर्णा कर्णा क्षात्र अस्ति । अस्तु अनुत्री अस्ति अस्ति कृष्टि अस्ति । अस्ति अस्ति । अस्ति । कर्त कर एक्सिके रहे अहे यह अध्यान कर अध्यक्ति हो रहे खेल हो। अध्यक्ति है है असे क्रिकेट के यह के के लेल के कि रोज्यात अकरण, कर्ने को ए. इन्हरूर के देश क्षारका दूप करें बचेही प्र<mark>ाक्ति हैं । यह करण क्षार प्राक्ति</mark> के एक ए. दुनेबार के **क** ्नर्वा केन्द्र र अनुभवेता मुख्य होता । जुलु त्रीयार होहफ, र्वा दु महान्यु महिन्द्र करक र द्वानुस्ता की एक एने एक ्या सम्पर्धानम् वर्षे प्रस्था पर्यापा के लेकि के प्रकृति होते हे सम्बद्धाः । कि प्रदूध स्थाप के लेकि संस्थित के iggerg er en spliggegigtelige foreboth om fin er en en en en en figer oog et en foogte falle op befolgsele. न्तर्ग केर राम रक्षण केर क्षाक्षण कर्मकार है। एक क्ष<del>ाक्षिक्षको अनेको के अनुस्तान क्षा</del> अर्थको के राज्य का क्षाका - कुर्यात्म मान्यात् । अने के के अने के के बोच करते हैं एक क्षेत्र के लगा के किया एक के बेच प्राप्त करता अपने क ranta e e e tido real e Caralle de la completa e esta esta esta en esta de combinada e en el combinada e en el duting that it is do not not be proceed to sometime the majoritation. He was refer to the contract of the solutions कर्ष १५ कुल के प्रकार बेंग्स, हो। उन्हों से उप में कुल महाचार करते कि प्रकार करते हैं अपने के हैं के सम्बन्धी સ્ટાર્ટ્ડ કર્યું અન્યું અને કર્યો કે ત્રું કરો તે કારો મું કરો **તામાં** તે અને આ જો કોઇ પ્રાપ્ત જે છે. તે કરતા મું કર્યું હોય છે. તે કરતા માટે કરતા માટે કરતા છે. તે કરતા માટે કરતા માટે કરતા માટે કરતા માટે કરતા છે. તે કરતા માટે કરતા મ

The second second of the secon

(8) apropagation to the form of the company of the professional many taken all that the company

contractor to perform work does not establish an actual loss based on the Respondent's inadequate or incomplete home improvement.

Largely based on the Respondent's testimony regarding specific areas which were not completed when he stopped working on the renovation, I conclude that the evidence supports the Claimant's claim that he sustained an actual loss with regard to finishing the walls and flooring in the renovated room and finishing the electrical work. Because there was very little evidence presented on what work under the Contract remained at the time that the Respondent stopped working, I rely on the Claimant's and Respondent's testimony and the Claimant's photographs in making a determination on this point. In criticizing the amount of the estimates presented by the Claimant at the hearing, the Respondent agreed that certain work was not completed by him, such as exposed electrical outlets, installation of the fan, and unfinished floors. Further, the Respondent testified that he was waiting on additional payment from the Claimant before he installed the Mitsubishi conditioning unit. Accordingly, I conclude that the evidence supports the Claimant's claim that the following items listed in the Claimant's summary were incomplete: patching and finishing of the walls in the renovated room, sanding and finishing the floor in the renovated room, completing electrical work, and installing the Mitsubishi conditioning unit. I also find the Claimant's report, that he had to hire another contractor to install supports in the shed because it had collapsed, to support a conclusion that the shed construction also was incomplete when the Respondent stopped working. I conclude that the Claimant has established an actual loss based on the incomplete home improvement of the above items and is eligible for compensation from the Fund.

and black in a 2 figure out, death of electronic region of  $\Gamma$  is the class of the analysis of the cona grande i a u spå detper, el 40 pa made. the force of the contract of the papership of a committee of a finite of the contract of the c ti ceas por empre a rapa from a sea seria filo domini il pero persona a control i imperito agrico adjocotico a deligio i c grices The Land of grighter which the parallel of the land of the contract of tag al limitativa e en estre la littera della comina di la la entre la la estra la regiona della comina della a la que a <del>religio en 18</del> de capacida **est** de receberar la compactación de la compactación de la compactación de and grouper, the sufficiency of the confidence of the property of the confidence of and restrictions and make the substitution of the state of the first of the contract of the state of the state yandi igirki letga ey ing kari ita a kilipa kilipa iya iya na li liyani iya — kilipi kali in isli ketili. orano malendi. La colonia del Esperialmon il colonia cantina della contra la filiamenta di Compto di combina di casa di ting the first of the contribution of the cont allegations of the attraction after the fight for an in any a safetiment freely to be attached กาษที่เกิดสัตนารคราง ก็เหมือให้ว่า จากก็, เรื่อวิวา<mark>ศักษากับเกิดโ</mark>บ พ.ศ. จากการที่สารว่า - **เกิด**กรับ ก็ตั้งการที่สุดเกิดให้จะก ads charalet i sopiazion de Luidia ed grande menos e e el como al la fina diffici de la desemb A Malang Berma, menghantan malang perpendahan digan Birah banggapangkan perpendangan per satural altricipa e districtiva, come matrico e processo (que de final altricipa de la consecució de la come Carrieráe (1915) o **mate**, a circular o promisio a carrier a male a liberar distribuição de constituição de la constituida de la constituição de la constituida de la constituição de la constituida de la constituida de la c la entide con ende constituir de conflict. La conflicta de la conflicta de la conflicta de personal de la conf

apit delignicit i a comunicatati di managara processi minimatati de basat politication.

athorfu by it and it is although save

What is the amount that the Claimant is entitled to recover from the Fund?

Having found eligibility for compensation, I must determine the amount of the Claimant's actual loss and the amount, if any, that the Claimant is entitled to recover. The Fund may not compensate a claimant for consequential or punitive damages, personal injury, attorney fees, court costs, or interest. Bus. Reg. § 8-405(e)(3); COMAR 09.08.03.03B(1). The MHIC's regulations provide three formulas to measure a claimant's actual loss, depending on the status of the contract work:

- (a) If the contractor abandoned the contract without doing any work, the claimant's actual loss shall be the amount which the claimant paid to the contractor under the contract.
- (b) If the contractor did work according to the contract and the claimant is not soliciting another contractor to complete the contract, the claimant's actual loss shall be the amount which the claimant paid to the original contractor less the value of any materials or services provided by the contractor.
- (c) If the contractor did work according to the contract and the claimant has solicited or is soliciting another contractor to complete the contract, the claimant's actual loss shall be the amounts the claimant has paid to or on behalf of the contractor under the original contract, added to any reasonable amounts the claimant has paid or will be required to pay another contractor to repair poor work done by the original contractor under the original contract and complete the original contract, less the original contract price. If the Commission determines that the original contract price is too unrealistically low or high to provide a proper basis for measuring actual loss, the Commission may adjust its measurement accordingly.

## COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(a)-(c).

None of the three regulatory formulas is appropriate in this case. The Respondent did not abandon the contract without doing any work, so that formula is inapplicable. COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(a). The Claimant hired other contractors to complete or remedy the Respondent's work, so the formula in which a claimant is not soliciting another contractor to complete the contract is also not applicable. COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(b). While the

李山·李林·西南南西 (1995) (1995) [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995] [1995]

त विकास सम्बद्ध में अने अन्य हा जिस्सा है। कि एक विकास कर प्राप्त के में स्टीविक कर के में सुकर है।

The first open and the formal language and the properties of the contract of t

පත්තු ඉහැක වන දැනීම පත්තු වලට විසින පත්තු ඉදුම පත්තුම කරන වැනි නැති නැති දැනිම් දිවුම් ම විදුන්ට විදින්ද මිදුන්ඩම්වීම නැති වූ පතු දැන්න කරන ම වෙන්නම් යන් වන වැනිම් වෙන්නම් කරන මු වෙන්නම් වේන අත්තුන්ට විදින්ද මිදුන්ඩම්වීම නැති වෙන්නම් දැන්නම් සිටිනම් සිට සිටිනම් සිටිනම් සිටිනම් සිටිනම් සිටිනම් සිටිනම්

The state of the contract of the first of the contract of the

BANGARAN BASI BIR ANDO

production of the second standard of the second sec

Respondent performed some work under the Contract and the Claimant has retained other contractors to complete that work, I conclude that COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(c) fails to appropriately measure the Claimant's actual loss because the contractors who were hired by the Claimant to complete the renovation performed additional work outside the scope of the Contract, but did not separate out the costs to complete the Respondent's remaining work under the Contract. As such, a calculation under COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(c) would not appropriately establish the Claimant's actual loss. Accordingly, I find the appropriate measure of the Claimant's compensable actual loss to be the agreed-upon Contract price, less payments made to the Respondent: \$4,585.00; which represents the final payment due to the Respondent to complete work under the Contract.

The Claimant contends that his actual loss is \$8,970.13. He states that this amount represents his actual loss based on the payments he made to other contractors to repair and complete the Respondent's work under the Contract. He provided a summary of costs as follows:

\$275.00	Patching holes and refacing walls
\$1,080.00 <sup>7</sup>	Sanding and finishing floor
\$1,030.13	Finishing carpentry and repairing brickwork
\$4,588.00	Installing ductless HVAC unit
\$4,025.00	Installing pervious pavers and landscaping
\$2,057.00	Complete electrical work
\$500.00	Fixing floor of shed, installing support posts
\$13,555.13	

Applying this figure to the calculation as set forth under COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(c), the Claimant claims that his actual loss is \$8,970.13.8 As already stated, I am not persuaded that this

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> At the hearing, the Claimant amended this amount to exclude flooring costs which were not part of the Respondent's Contract.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The attorney for the Fund accepted the Claimant's calculation, and recommended reimbursement in the amount of \$8,970.13.

. 25 กับ 10 1 - 10 กับ 46 ราคทางการ การ (10 การความสิงเพลาการูก การความสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสุ

ระชายแห่ง ค.ศ. พ.ศ. เรียด

्रमानुष्ट वर्षा मुक्ति के तुर्विष्टक्षा, अधाना स्वतंत्रम् । भागाना प्राप्त स्वतंत्र । भागाना वर्षे के वर्षे का

estante de la filipa de la como esta de la como de la c La como de la filipa de la como d

经净股份净值 人名斯坦曼德 计电影中毒 对严肃

and the property of the proper

一种中国是一种中的自身的,2010

trining for the graph of the contract property.

医自己性溃疡 人名英格兰姓氏 化电路电流 经收益

THE THE TOTAL PROPERTY OF THE POST AND A STREET

1941 JAN

in til planta pariste i demonstrato e espera espera de la compresión per la completa e en como de la que aciona La compresión e companyament, como en está de la compresión de l

The continuent of the continue

 figure accurately represents the actual loss because it includes costs for work performed by other contractors which is not included in the Contract and was not required to complete the incomplete home improvement.

The Claimant's evidence establishes an actual compensable loss in the amount of \$3,912.00, based on items which the Respondent agreed were incomplete, and for which the invoices match. However, the evidence also supports a compensable loss for remaining work to install the external Mitsubishi conditioning unit. I do not find the Claimant's evidence consisting of an invoice for installation of a ductless HVAC system helpful to a determination on the cost to complete the installation. Because the parties agreed on the original Contract price, and I conclude that the Claimant's actual loss represents the costs to complete the renovation, I find that the original Contract price, less payments made to the Respondent, in the amount of \$4,585.00, better represents the compensable actual loss.

The Business Regulation Article caps a claimant's recovery at \$20,000.00 for acts or omissions of one contractor and provides that a claimant may not recover more than the amount paid to the contractor against whom the claim is filed. Bus. Reg. § 8-405(e)(1), (5); COMAR 09.08.03.03B(4), D(2)(a). In this case, the Claimant's actual loss is less than the amount paid to the Respondent and less than \$20,000.00. Therefore, the Claimant is entitled to recover his actual loss of \$4,585.00.

# PROPOSED CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

I conclude that the Claimant has sustained an actual and compensable loss of \$4,585.00 as a result of the Respondent's acts or omissions. Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. §§ 8-401, 8-405 (2015); COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(c). I further conclude that the Claimant is entitled to recover

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> This figure includes the costs for patching holes and refacing walls (\$275.00), sanding and finishing the floor (\$1,080.00), completing electrical work (\$2,057.00), and installing support posts in the shed (\$500.00).

under militeration met de di diduite en productivi en en la prefere en un interpretare en la prefere de la faction de la production de la prod

The rest of the second second

the control of the decided to a construction of the control of the

# 

And the second contraction of the second sec

<sup>्</sup>राहरी है। 'स्पिनिकार कर सुक्र वित्तान स्तार्यक्र एक स्थान है। जिल्लाकार स्वार्यक किया है। इस वितार के प्रिकार है। क्रिकेट कर है कि से से सुक्रियों के सामित है। 'से क्रिकेट के किया है के क्रिकेट के सुक्र के किया के क्रिकेट

\$4,585.00 from the Fund. Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-405(e)(1), (5) (2015); COMAR 09.08.03.03B(3)(c); COMAR 09.08.03.03D(2)(a).

### **RECOMMENDED ORDER**

I RECOMMEND that the Maryland Home Improvement Commission:

ORDER that the Maryland Home Improvement Guaranty Fund award the Claimant \$4,585.00; and

ORDER that the Respondent is ineligible for a Maryland Home Improvement

Commission license until the Respondent reimburses the Guaranty Fund for all monies disbursed under this Order, plus annual interest of ten percent (10%) as set by the Maryland Home

Improvement Commission; 10 and

**ORDER** that the records and publications of the Maryland Home Improvement Commission reflect this decision.

February 22, 2021
Date Decision Issued

CONFIDENTIAL

Michelle W. Cole Administrative Law Judge

MWC/kdp #190641

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See Md. Code Ann., Bus. Reg. § 8-410(a)(1)(iii) (2015); COMAR 09.08.01.20.

TO DESCRIPTION OF A SECURITE PROSPER WAS A SECURITION OF THE SECURITION OF THE SECURITION OF THE SECURITION OF Commence of the contract of th um acception of the group of the agree<mark>t all agreement</mark> technical conferminations and a leafer All hat itte ball b presente on the form of bally and a title of leave in the plan of the half at 1.200 The Alikansty's of hand all high the splittly appreliance by the beautiful and a copy of the Additionable on of the classic specific arrange of paids a ranger no principality in il vigili nadiona, mai ili il a collega i di tach ili a salika ili ili di tach ili a grant bake of this bank and regally Project AM. The first wall both Line of the

Title Teyrir <mark>Bug-spillar (d.c.</mark> 19

# PROPOSED ORDER

WHEREFORE, this 2<sup>nd</sup> day of June, 2021, Panel B of the Maryland Home Improvement Commission approves the Recommended Order of the Administrative Law Judge and unless any parties files with the Commission within twenty (20) days of this date written exceptions and/or a request to present arguments, then this Proposed Order will become final at the end of the twenty (20) day period. By law the parties then have an additional thirty (30) day period during which they may file an appeal to Circuit Court.

<u>Joseph Tunney</u>

Joseph Tunney
Chairman
Panel B
MARYLAND HOME IMPROVEMENT
COMMISSION

and regulation of the first constraint of the first of the first constraint of the first of the and a specific for the second contraction and the second contraction of the second of the second contraction of the second ංගුවේ. එම දැන්නමුල් සමයනු මිනි කම්කට <mark>මෙන දුන්නවු නොවනට මුදුන යනුවීම වීමට සුර</mark> එකෙන යනුමුන් සම්බ ા ૧૯૯માં મુખ્ય કરામાં સુર્યોન કારણ માત્રા મુખ્યાની ઉપાર્થી માર્ગા લાગ કરી કે લેવા વાર્ગા કરિયાની લેકાઇ, છા આ વધા છ ngress sand singlessy year a broad, was more than his some service in a section, and section of in a compression of the the will believe the or begins of the fifty from the transfer of the contract of .....